





## Real Estate Lending and Sustainability: The Case for Better Risk Management

With thanks to



5<sup>th</sup> November 2015

#sustainablelending



#### THE UK'S LEADING COMMERCIAL PROPERTY OWNERS WORKING TOGETHER TO IMPROVE THE SUSTAINABILITY OF EXISTING COMMERCIAL BUILDING STOCK



A collaboration of the UK's leading property owners who work together to improve the sustainability of the UK's existing commercial buildings.

Our aim is to

Enable market transformation through sustainability leadership and knowledge sharing across the property industry.





#### Members





Real Estate Debt Market

## Total volume of European CRE debt actually increased by $\in$ 23 billion over the course of 2014

**TOTAL EUROPEAN CRE INVESTMENT TURNOVER** 2001 to 2014



**a**bb Source: CBRE Research

#### Minimum Energy Efficiency Standards

Unlawful in England & Wales to let residential or business premises that do not meet EPC rating of 'E' or above





### **CRE Lending Working Group**





Deutsche Asset & Wealth Management





General Investment Management

Legal&



The authoritative voice of the European Market













#### Why is sustainability relevant?

#### Risk management:

Incorporate sustainability considerations into due diligence, underwriting, deal structuring and loan documentation

- Better ongoing monitoring of existing loan portfolio
- Future-proofing regarding regulation and regulators!
- Interest from SRI investment community?
- Improved borrower relationship
- Opportunities for new products & business models



#### MEES Risks....



PARTNERSHIP

@bbpuk #sustainablelending

#### Mitigation strategy – New lending decisions

- REVIEW EPCS AS PART OF DUE DILIGENCE
- ASSESS & UNDERWRITE RISK
- CONSIDER STRUCTURING & LOAN DOCUMENTATION
  - LMA real estate finance template facility agreement

This certificate shows the energy rating of this building. It he building fabric and the heating, ventilation, cooling ar compared to two benchmarks for this type of building: and one appropriate for existing buildings. There is more	
he building fabric and the heating, ventilation, cooling an compared to two benchmarks for this type of building: or and one appropriate for existing buildings. There is more	
This certificate shows the energy rating of this building. It indicates the energy efficiency of the building fabric and the heating, ventilation, cooling and lighting systems. The rating is compared to two benchmarks for this type of building; one appropriate for new buildings and one appropriate for existing buildings. There is more advice on how to interpret this information on the Government's website www.communities.gov.uk/epbd.	
Energy Performance Asset Rating	
More energy efficient	
A.P.	C amount
A 0.25	
B	This is how energy efficient
D 26-50	the building is.
C 51.75	
D 76 100	
E 101.125	
F 126-150	
0	
G Over 150	
Less energy efficient	
rechnical information	Benchmarks
fain heating fuel: Grid Supplied Electricity subding environment: Mixed-mode with Mechanical Ventilat	
otal useful floor area (m'): 615	50 If newly built
building complexitly (NOS level): 4 building emission rate (kgC0,/m²): 29.5	118 If typical of the existing stock



#### Mitigation strategy - Existing loan book

START COLLECTING & MONITORING EPC DATA
INCORPORATE DATA INTO EXISTING MONITORING





- REVIEW LOAN DOCUMENTATION
- ESTABLISH A PROACTIVE BORROWER ENGAGEMENT STRATEGY



#### Wider sustainability considerations



PARTNERSHIP

@bbpuk #sustainablelending

#### Beyond risk management...







#### **BBP** Industry Insight





**J**@bbpuk #sustainablelending

### Keeping in touch with the BBP





## 2015 RESULTS RELEASE

#### Evidence from the academic literature How is sustainability related to credit risk...?

- No upside, but...
- Better performing property = better credit risk?
- 20-30% lower default rates associated with Energy Star and LEED certified buildings (An and Pivo, 2015)

Financial benefits

- Higher rental levels
- Lower vacancy levels
- Lower operating costs
- Higher capital values
- Increased asset liquidity

#### ...and the capital market?



## **About GRESB**

Actionable transparency for institutional investors

- A platform to assess the performance of companies and funds
- A systematic approach to score listed companies and private entities
- Global benchmark for ESG performance



"GRESB's mission is to enhance and protect shareholder value by evaluating and improving sustainability best practices in the global real asset sector."

## **GRESB Real Estate**

In numbers



### **GRESB** Debt

Actionable transparency for institutional investors

- Applying the same mission, vision and process to fixed income property investors
- 2015 Inaugural Debt Survey—
  - Assesses the sustainability performance and engagement of lenders



## **Aspects and dimensions**

6 aspects, all of which look at ESG factors and how they are implemented

#### Management & Policy

#### Implementation & Lender Practice





Risks (bribery & corruption)



Policy & Disclosure



Due Diligence



Monitoring



Opportunities

## **Data validation process**

Three-layer procedure to achieve investment-grade data



## GRESB Debt 2015 Participation

## **Participation**

Diverse universe of funds reporting

#### • 10 funds

- \$5.03 billion in aggregate NAV
- 127 assets (loans)
- Representing 7% of the PERE debt fund universe

## **Participation**

#### Based on NAV



## **Participation**

Based on NAV





## **Overall scores**

GRESB Model reflects absolute and relative performance of Debt funds





Breaking down scores into E, S, and G



# GRESB Debt Main Trends

#### **Main trends**



## **Organizational Integration**



#### **Risk Management**



#### **Standardization and Capture**

## **Trend 1: Organizational Integration**

• How well is sustainability integrated throughout an organization?

• Among funds part of a larger investment management organization, are corporate objectives incorporated into real estate lending units?

"By adopting our responsible property investment process, our debt funds seek to apply the same rigorous approach to lending decisions. As part of our investment process, we review the sustainability performance and risks of the underlying properties (environmental audit and building surveys, energy performance certificates, and green building certification such as, BREEAM, LEED, Energy Star, DGMB, and Minergie). The lending committee submission contains a section summarizing the findings."

David Hirst, Executive Director, Head of Operations, Global Real Estate UK at UBS

#### **Organizational Integration**

Participating funds with one or more persons responsible for implementing sustainability



- (71%) Have sustainability objectives and incorporate them in the overall business
- (29%) Find incorporation of sustainability objectives not applicable

#### **Organizational Integration**

Participating funds with a policy that addresses environmental issues at the collateral level



- (14%) Disclose collateral sustainabiity performance
- (57%) Do not disclose collateral sustainability performance
- (29%) Find disclosure of collateral sustainability performance not applicable
## Wrap-up—Organizational Integration

- Real estate debt funds slower to embrace ESG integration than real estate equity investors
- Sustainability professionals and real estate lenders within the same organization may not be communicating
- Structural shift in organizational communication may be necessary

## **Trend 2: Risk Management**

- How aware are lenders about sustainability risks?
- How well are they managing these risks?
- Recent academic research indicates property sustainability features impact loan performance

"The sustainability profile of commercial real estate players and properties is becoming increasingly important for banks given the growing number of building regulations, tenants' expectations in this area and the risks posed by climate change. Our collaboration with GRESB allows ABN AMRO to further integrate sustainability into its real estate financing process, a move closely aligned with the bank's aim to play an active role in making the real estate sector more sustainable."

Rutger Schuur, Head of Real Estate & Public Sector Clients at ABN AMRO

# **Property-level sustainability risks reviewed**



### **Borrower-level sustainability performance review**



## Wrap-up—Risk Management

- Managing downside risk is critical to delivering consistent riskadjusted returns
- Requesting and reviewing information pertaining to ESG factors
- During due diligence and throughout the loan term
- To identify risks and become better positioned to mitigate them

## **Trend 3: Standardization and Capture**

- Loan origination requires degree of customization
- Sustainability risk assessment and management is not standard practice in real estate lending
- When such assessment and labeling sit outside systematic processes and standard practices, corresponding risks and opportunities typically remain uncaptured

"Fannie Mae has integrated sustainability considerations into its underwriting, asset management, and securitization processes. We have done this by leveraging industry-accepted, third party-verified, green building certifications, and by creating our own Green Financing solutions to serve the US Multifamily debt market. By labeling related mortgages and securities, we are able to capture and track the progress and performance of Green MBS."

Chrissa Pagitsas, Director Green Initiative at Fannie Mae Multifamily.

# **Capturing risks & opportunities**

### Standard due diligence items



## Wrap-up—Standardization and Capture

- Standardizing borrower-submitted sustainability-based asset plans may allow lenders to better identify sustainability risks and mitigation strategies
- If transaction features that lead to positive environmental or social outcomes are not systematically labeled, they cannot be tracked or reported

# GRESB Debt Conclusion & Next Steps

## **Innovation in Practice**

### Real world ESG integration in real estate lending

### Innovation in Practice - ABN AMRO

In 2015, ABN AMRO became the first commercial bank in the Netherlands to issue a euro green bond. Proceeds were tied to assets including mortgages on highly energy-efficient homes, loans for solar panels on existing homes and commercial real estate loans for the construction and financing of energy efficient buildings. The Bank utilizes property level sustainability data, such as Energy Performance Certificates (EPCs) and green building ratings to identify these assets within its portfolio.

ABN AMRO has also begun leveraging borrower-level sustainability data in the form of corporate ESG ratings: "The sustainability profile of commercial real estate players and properties is becoming increasingly important for banks given the growing number of building regulations, tenants' expectations in this area and the risks posed by clima te change. Our collaboration with GRESB allows ABN AMRO to further integrate sustainability into its real estate financing process, a move closely aligned with the bank's aim to play an active role in making the real est

Rutger Schuur, Head of Real Estate & Public Sector Clients at ABN AMRO

#### Innovation in Practice – Fannie Mae

As of the year end 2014, Fannie Mae has financed \$140 million in Green Preservation Plus loans or loans that are backed by a property with a Green Building certification. These loans are securitized as Green Mortgage Backed Securitizes (Green MBS), a securitization standard set by Fannie Mae. Fannie Mae collects the ENERGY STAR® Score for Multifamily Housing and Source Energy Use Intensity from properties receiving Fannie Mae Green Financing and from properties that are located in jurisdictions with energy benchmarking reporting laws, such as New York City, Chicago and Washington, DC.

"Fannie Mae has integrated sustainability considerations into its underwriting, asset management, and securitization processes. We have done this by leveraging industryaccepted, third party-verified, green building certifications, and by creating our own Green Financing solutions to serve the US Multifamily debt market. By labeling related mortgages and securities, we are able to capture and track the progress and performance of Green MBS."

Chrissa Pagitsas, Director Green Initiative at Fannie Mae Multifamily.

### Innovation in Practice -UBS Asset Management

UBS real estate debt funds are embedded within UBS's Global Real Estate (GRE) business. The portfolio management team has significant direct real estate experience and also utilizes sourcing, underwriting and asset management skills from the GRE equity teams in fully analyzing the assets which are taken as security for loans.

GRE's stated goals are a 20% reduction of greenhouse gas emissions and a 10% reduction of the energy consumption at portfolio properties every 5 years, on a rolling basis. Other quantitative goals include reducing residual waste, increasing the recycling rate above 50% and reducing the water consumption of portfolio properties by monitoring consumption and developing specific water saving measures in different properties. These goals apply to debt and equity funds alike.

"By adopting our responsible property investment process, our debt funds seek to apply the same rigorous approach to lending decisions. As part of our investment process, we review the sustainability performance and risks of the underlying properties (environmental audit and building surveys, energy performance certificates, and green building certification such as, BREEAM, LEED, Energy Star, DGMB, and Minergie). The lending committee submission contains a section summarizing the findings."

David Hirst, Executive Director, Head of Operations, Global Real Estate UK at UBS

## **Results release**

For GRESB Debt Participants and Investor Members

- Access results via the GRESB Portal today
  - Participants may log-in to view their Scorecards and Benchmark Reports
  - GRESB Investor Members may log-in to request data access to the debt funds in which they invest



# Next steps for GRESB Real Estate Debt

Further expansion of services and tools

### Debt Assessment

- Consultation period begins today
- Further development of assessment for 2016
- Open to broader lender participant base
- ESG data access for lenders
  - ESG profile of borrowers/sponsors
- Green Bond Working Group
  - Sharing information and evolving best practices to stimulate green property bond transactions



s.anzinger@gresb.com















Peter Cosmetatos CEO CREFC Europe John Gellatly Head of Global Indirect Real Estate, EMEA Aviva Investors James Bretten Portfolio Controls Commercial Real Estate Credit Royal Bank of Scotland Colin Humphries Assistant Portfolio Manager UBS Participating Real Estate Mortgage Fund UBS

#sustainablelending